

Comm-036



UNITED STATES  
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001



January 21, 2010

Dane L. Finerfrock, Director  
Utah Division of Radiation Control  
P.O. Box 144850  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-4850

Dear Mr. Finerfrock;

We have reviewed the proposed changes to the Utah regulations R313-25-8, received by our office on January 6, 2010. These regulations were reviewed by comparison to the equivalent Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) rules in 10 CFR Part 61. We discussed our review of the regulations with you on January 21, 2010.

As a result of our review, we have three comments that have been identified in the enclosure. Please note that we have limited our review to regulations required for compatibility and/or health and safety and the identification of program elements that create conflicts, duplications or gaps in the orderly pattern of regulations on a nationwide basis (See the 1997 Policy Statement on Adequacy and Compatibility of Agreement State Programs). Under our current procedure, a finding that the Utah's regulations meet the compatibility and health and safety categories of the equivalent NRC regulation may only be made based on a review of the final Utah regulations. However, we have determined that if your proposed regulations were adopted, incorporating our comments and without other significant change, they would meet the compatibility and health and safety categories established in the Office of Federal and State Materials and Environmental Management Programs (FSME) Procedure SA-200.

We request that when the proposed regulations are adopted and published as final regulations, a copy of the "as published" regulations be provided to us for review. As requested in FSME Procedure SA-201, "Review of State Regulatory Requirements," please highlight the final changes, and provide a copy to Division of Materials Safety and State Agreements, FSME.

The SRS Data Sheet summarizes our knowledge of the status of other Utah regulations, as indicated. Please let us know if you note any inaccuracies, or have any comments on the information contained in the SRS Data Sheet. This letter, including the SRS Data Sheet, is posted on the FSME website: <http://nrc-stp.ornl.gov/rulemaking.html>.

The NRC would also like respond to the *Statement of Basis for Administrative Rulemaking*, dated December 1, 2009 which is part of the December 8, 2009 Radiation Control Board Information Packet as posted on your website and e-mailed to Duncan White on December 10, 2009. The Statement notes that the Utah Radiation Control Board "intends to issue a determination . . . about whether there are 'corresponding federal regulations that are not adequate to protect public health and the environment of the state.'" Statement of Basis at 11. The Statement of Basis also concludes that NRC has recognized "the inadequacy of its current regulations." Statement of Basis at 8. Your characterization of NRC's regulations and conclusions regarding their adequacy is in error. Although the current regulations did not consider the disposal of significant quantities of depleted uranium, they are adequate to ensure

the protection of the public health and safety. The requirements in 10 CFR Part 61 Subpart C provide the performance objectives that all disposal facility licensees must comply with before disposing of any low-level radioactive waste. The NRC's recommendation to update a site's performance assessment prior to disposal of significant quantities of depleted uranium would ensure that the licensee continues to comply with these requirements; a recommendation to ensure compliance with the existing regulations does not indicate that the regulations are inadequate. The NRC's rulemaking effort will clarify these requirements and provide additional guidance to licensees and the Agreement States that are dealing with the disposal of unique waste streams, but engaging in a rulemaking to update the NRC's regulations does not mean that the current regulations are inadequate to protect the public health and safety while rulemaking is pursued to improve the regulations.

If you have any questions regarding the review, the compatibility and health and safety categories, or any of the NRC regulations used in the review, please contact Kathleen Schneider, State Regulation Review Coordinator at 301-415-2320 ([kathleen.schneider@nrc.gov](mailto:kathleen.schneider@nrc.gov)) or Dennis Sollenberger at 301-415-2819 ([dennis.sollenberger@nrc.gov](mailto:dennis.sollenberger@nrc.gov)).

Sincerely,

 for T. Reis

Terrence Reis, Deputy Director  
Division of Materials Safety and State Agreements  
Office of Federal and State Materials  
and Environmental Management Programs

Enclosures:  
As stated

**COMPATIBILITY COMMENT ON UTAH PROPOSED REGULATIONS**

STATE SECTION		NRC SECTION	RATS ID	CATEGORY	SUBJECT and COMMENTS
1	R313-25-8 (2)(a)	61.13	N/A		<p><b>Technical analyses</b> <b>Definition of Depleted Uranium</b></p> <p>To clarify the proposed Utah regulation so that it comports with NRC Comment 3 below, Utah should revise R313-25-8 (2)(a) as follows:</p> <p>(2)(a) Any facility that proposes to land dispose of significant quantities of <b>concentrated</b> depleted uranium, more than one metric ton in total accumulation, after [effective date of rule] shall submit for the Executive Secretary's review and approval a performance assessment that demonstrates that the performance standards specified in 10 CFR Part 61 and corresponding provisions of Utah rules will be met for the total quantities of depleted uranium and other wastes, including wastes already disposed of and the quantities of <b>concentrated</b> depleted uranium the facility now proposes to dispose. Any such performance assessment shall be revised as needed to reflect ongoing guidance and rulemaking from NRC. For purposes of this performance assessment, the compliance period will be a minimum of 10,000 years. Additional simulations will be performed for a qualitative analysis for the period where peak dose occurs.</p>
2	R313-25-8 (2)(b)	61.13	N/A		<p><b>Technical analyses</b> <b>Definition of Depleted Uranium</b></p> <p>To clarify the proposed Utah regulation so that it comports with NRC Comment 3 below,, Utah should revise R313-25-8 (2)(b) as follows:</p>

STATE SECTION		NRC SECTION	RATS ID	CATEGORY	SUBJECT and COMMENTS
					(2)(b) No facility may dispose of significant quantities of <b>concentrated</b> depleted uranium prior to the approval by the Executive Secretary of the performance assessment required in R313-25-8(2)(a).
3	R313-25-8 (2)(c)	61.13 40.4	N/A	H&S A	<p><b>Technical analyses</b> <b>Definition of Depleted Uranium</b></p> <p>Utah's proposed regulation redefines depleted uranium as "waste with depleted uranium concentrations greater than 5% by weight" and creates conflicts with the definition of depleted uranium in 10 CFR 40.4, which is Compatibility Category A designation. Since the other provisions in R313-25-8 (2) address significant quantities of depleted uranium, the following change would eliminate the conflict: "For purposes of this R. 313-25-8(2) only, <u>concentrated</u> depleted uranium means waste with depleted uranium concentrations greater than 5 % by weight."</p> <p>Utah needs to add the phrase "concentrated" as noted above to R313-25-8 (2)(c) to meet the Compatibility Category A designation assigned to Section 10 CFR 40.4, Definition of Depleted Uranium.</p>

**STATE REGULATION STATUS**

Tracking Ticket Number: 10-1  
Date: 1/21/2010

State: Utah  
[ 1 amendment(s) reviewed is identified by a ★  
at the beginning of the equivalent NRC requirement.]

RATS ID	NRC Chronology Identification	Date Due for State Adoption	Incoming Package	Outgoing Package	Notes
1991-1	Safety Requirements for Radiographic Equipment Part 34 55 FR 843 (Superseded by 1997-5)	01/10/1994	Final ML032180130	No Comments 08/28/2003 ML032400630	Utah has adopted Final Regulations Equivalent to RATS ID: 1997-5.
1991-2	ASNT Certification of Radiographers Part 34 56 FR 11504 (Superseded by 1997-5)	none	Not Required	Not Required	Utah has adopted Final Regulations Equivalent to RATS ID: 1997-5.
1991-3	Standards for Protection Against Radiation Part 20 56 FR 23360; 56 FR 61352; 57 FR 38588; 57 FR 57877; 58 FR 67657; 59 FR 41641; 60 FR 20183;	01/01/1994	Final	No Comments 02/10/1998	
1991-4	Notification of Incidents Parts 20, 30, 31, 34, 39, 40, 70 56 FR 64980;	10/15/1994	Final ML032180130	Comments 08/28/2003 ML032400630	
1992-1	Quality Management Program and Misadministrations Part 35 56 FR 34104 (Superseded by 2002-2)	01/27/1995	Not Required	Not Required	Utah has adopted Final Regulations Equivalent to RATS ID: 2002-2.
1992-2	Eliminating the Recordkeeping Requirements for Departures from Manufacturer's Instructions Parts 30, 35 57 FR 45586	none	Not Required	Not Required	These regulation changes are not required to be adopted for purposes of Compatibility.

RATS ID	NRC Chronology Identification	Date Due for State Adoption	Incoming Package	Outgoing Package	Notes
1993-1	Decommissioning Recordkeeping and License Termination: Documentation Additions [Restricted areas and spill sites] Parts 30, 40 58 FR 39628	10/25/1996	Final	No Comments 01/08/1997	
1993-2	Licensing and Radiation Safety Requirements for Irradiators Part 36 58 FR 7715	07/01/1996	Final	No Comments 06/14/2000	
1993-3	Definition of Land Disposal and Waste Site QA Program Part 61 58 FR 33886	07/22/1996	Final ML071990559	No Comments 09/04/2007 ML072470237	
1994-1	Self-Guarantee as an Additional Financial Mechanism Parts 30, 40, 70 58 FR 68726; 59 FR 1618	none	Not Required	Not Required	These regulation changes are not required to be adopted for purposes of Compatibility.
1994-2	Uranium Mill Tailings Regulations: Conforming NRC Requirements to EPA Standards Part 40 59 FR 28220	07/01/1997	Final ML023100574	No Comments 11/22/2002 ML023290240	
1994-3	Timeliness in Decommissioning Material Facilities Parts 30, 40, 70 59 FR 36026	08/15/1997	Final	No Comments 02/10/1998	
1995-1	Preparation, Transfer for Commercial Distribution, and Use of Byproduct Material for Medical Use Parts 30, 32, 35 59 FR 61767; 59 FR 65243; 60 FR 322	01/01/1998	Final	No Comments 02/10/1998	
1995-2	Frequency of Medical Examinations for Use of Respiratory Protection Equipment Part 20 60 FR 7900	03/13/1998	Final ML071990559	No Comments 09/04/2007 ML072470237	

RATS ID	NRC Chronology Identification	Date Due for State Adoption	Incoming Package	Outgoing Package	Notes
1995-3	Low-Level Waste Shipment Manifest Information and Reporting Parts 20, 61 60 FR 15649; 60 FR 25983	03/01/1998	Final ML071990559	No Comments 09/04/2007 ML072470237	
1995-4	Performance Requirements for Radiography Equipment Part 34 60 FR 28323 (Superseded by 1997-5)	06/30/1998	Final ML032180130	No Comments 08/28/2003 ML032400630	Utah has adopted Final Regulations Equivalent to RATS ID: 1997-5.
1995-5	Radiation Protection Requirements: Amended Definitions and Criteria Parts 19, 20 60 FR 36038	08/14/1998	Final ML071990559	No Comments 09/04/2007 ML072470237	
1995-6	Clarification of Decommissioning Funding Requirements Parts 30, 40, 70 60 FR 38235	11/24/1998	Final	No Comments 02/10/1998	
1995-7	Medical Administration of Radiation and Radioactive Materials Parts 20, 35 60 FR 48623 (Superseded by 2002-2 and 2005-2)	10/20/1998	Not Required	Not Required	Utah has adopted Final Regulations Equivalent to RATS IDs: 2002-2 and 2005-2.
1996-1	Compatibility with the International Atomic Energy Agency Part 71 60 FR 50248; 61 FR 28724 (Superseded by 2004-1)	04/01/1999	Final	No Comments 04/16/1999	
1996-2	One Time Extension of Certain Byproduct, Source and Special Nuclear Materials Licenses Parts 30, 40, 70 61 FR 1109	02/15/1999	Not Required	Not Required	These regulation changes are not required to be adopted for purposes of Compatibility.

RATS ID	NRC Chronology Identification	Date Due for State Adoption	Incoming Package	Outgoing Package	Notes
1996-3	Termination or Transfer of Licensed Activities: Record keeping Requirements Parts 20, 30, 40, 61, 70 61 FR 24669	06/17/1999	Final	No Comments 02/10/1998	Part 30 only
1997-1	Resolution of Dual Regulation of Airborne Effluents of Radioactive Materials; Clean Air Act Part 20 61 FR 65120	01/9/2000	Final ML071990559	No Comments 09/04/2007 ML072470237	
1997-2	Recognition of Agreement State Licenses in Areas Under Exclusive Federal Jurisdiction Within an Agreement State Part 150 62 FR 1662	02/27/2000	Final ML032180130	No Comments 08/28/2003 ML032400630	
1997-3	Criteria for the Release of Individuals Administered Radioactive Material Parts 20, 35 62 FR 4120	05/29/2000	Final ML071990559	No Comments 09/04/2007 ML072470237	
1997-4	Fissile Material Shipments and Exemptions Part 71 62 FR 5907 (Superseded by 2004-1)	02/10/2000	Not Required	Not Required	These regulation changes are not required to be adopted for purposes of Compatibility. (See STP-97-078)
1997-5	Licenses for Industrial Radiography and Radiation Safety Requirements for Industrial Radiography Operations Parts 30, 34, 71, 150 62 FR 28947	06/27/2000	Final	No Comments 04/01/1998	
1997-6	Radiological Criteria for License Termination Parts 20, 30, 40, 70 62 FR 39057	08/20/2000	Final	No Comments 06/14/2000	
1997-7	Exempt Distribution of a Radioactive Drug Containing One Micro curie of Carbon-14 Urea Part 30 62 FR 63634	01/02/2001	Final	No Comments 04/16/1999	



RATS ID	NRC Chronology Identification	Date Due for State Adoption	Incoming Package	Outgoing Package	Notes
1998-1	Deliberate Misconduct by Unlicensed Persons Parts 30, 40, 61, 70, 71, 150 63 FR 1890; 63 FR 13773	02/12/2001	Final ML011100015	No Comments 07/31/2001 ML012150220	
1998-2	Self-Guarantee of Decommisioning Funding by Nonprofit and Non-Bond-Issuing Licensees Parts 30, 40, 70 63 FR 29635	07/01/2001	Not Required	Not Required	These regulation changes are not required to be adopted for purposes of Compatibility.
1998-3	License Term for Medical Use Licenses Part 35 63 FR 31604 (Superceded by 2002-2)	07/10/2001	Not Required	Not Required	These regulation changes are not required to be adopted for purposes of Compatibility. (See STP-98-074) Utah has adopted Final Regulation equivalent to RATS ID: 2002-2.
1998-4	Licenses for Industrial Radiography and Radiation Safety Requirements for Industrial Radiographic Operations Part 34 63 FR 37059	07/09/2001	Final ML071990559	No Comments 09/04/2007 ML072470237	
1998-5	Minor Corrections, Clarifying Changes, and a Minor Policy Change Parts 20, 35, 36 63 FR 39477; 63 FR 45393	10/26/2001	Final ML032510947	No Comments 09/16/2003 ML032730694	
1998-6	Transfer for Disposal and Manifests: Minor Technical Conforming Amendment Part 20 63 FR 50127	11/20/2001	Final ML013530478	No Comments 02/07/2002 ML020390486	
1999-1	Radiological Criteria for License Termination of Uranium Recovery Facilities Part 40 64 FR 17506	06/11/2002	Final ML023100574	No Comments 11/22/2002 ML023290240	

RATS ID	NRC Chronology Identification	Date Due for State Adoption	Incoming Package	Outgoing Package	Notes
1999-2	Requirements for Those Who Possess Certain Industrial Devices Containing Byproduct Material to Provide Requested Information Part 31 64 FR 42269	10/04/2002	Not Required	Not Required	These regulation changes are not required to be adopted for purposes of Compatibility.
1999-3	Respiratory Protection and Controls to Restrict Internal Exposure Part 20 64 FR 54543; 64 FR 55524	02/02/2003	Final ML013530478	No Comments 02/07/2002 ML020390486	
2000-1	Energy Compensation Sources for Well Logging and Other Regulatory Clarifications Part 39 65 FR 20337	05/17/2003	Final ML012850044	No Comments 12/27/2001 ML020020182	
2000-2	New Dosimetry Technology Parts 34, 36, 39 65 FR 63750	01/08/2004	Final ML052850130	No Comments 10/20/2005 ML052940121	
2001-1	Requirements for Certain Generally Licensed Industrial Devices Containing Byproduct Material Parts 30, 31, 32 65 FR 79162	02/16/2004	Final ML040580276	No Comments 03/08/2004 ML040690493	
2002-1	Revision of the Skin Dose Limit Part 20 67 FR 16298	04/05/2005	Final ML052640263	No Comments 10/18/2005 ML052930360	
2002-2	Medical Use of Byproduct Material Parts 20, 32, 35 67 FR 20249	10/24/2005	Final ML052640263	No Comments 10/18/2005 ML052930360	
2003-1	Financial Assurance for Materials Licensees Parts 30, 40, 70 68 FR 57327	12/03/2006	Final ML062910213	No Comments 11/09/2006 ML063130115	

RATS ID	NRC Chronology Identification	Date Due for State Adoption	Incoming Package	Outgoing Package	Notes
2004-1	Compatibility With IAEA Transportation Safety Standards and Other Transportation Safety Amendments Part 71 69 FR 3697	10/01/2007	Final ML080350285	No Comments 02/26/2008 ML080560403	
2005-1	Security Requirements for Portable Gauges Containing Byproduct Material Part 30 70 FR 2001	07/11/2008	Final ML070370332	No Comments 03/06/2007 ML0706050102	
2005-2	Medical Use of Byproduct Material - Recognition of Specialty Boards Part 35 70 FR 16336; 71 FR 1926	04/29/2008	Final ML062000081	No Comments 08/02/2006 ML062150142	
2005-3	Increased Controls for Risk-Significant Radioactive Sources (NRC Order EA-05-090) 70 FR 72128	12/01/2005	License Condition ML052920243	No Comments 10/20/2005 ML052940078	
2006-1	Minor Amendments Parts 20, 30, 32, 35, 40 and 70 71 FR 15005	03/27/2009	Final ML091540302	No Comments 07/02/2009 ML091730130	
2006-2	National Source Tracking System - Serialization Requirements Part 32 with reference to Part 20 Appendix E 71 FR 65685	02/06/2007	Final ML080370626	No Comments 02/28/2008 ML080590006	
2006-3	National Source Tracking System Part 20 71 FR 65685, 72 FR 59162	01/31/2009	Final ML080370626	No Comments 02/28/2008 ML080590006	
2007-1	Medical Use of Byproduct Material - Minor Corrections and Clarifications Parts 32 and 35 72 FR 45147, 54207	10/29/2010	Final ML091540302	No Comments 07/02/2009 ML091730130	

RATS ID	NRC Chronology Identification	Date Due for State Adoption	Incoming Package	Outgoing Package	Notes
2007-2	Exemptions From Licensing, General Licenses, and Distribution of Byproduct Material: Licensing and Reporting Requirements Parts 30, 31, 32, 150 72 FR 58473	12/17/2010			
2007-3	Requirements for Expanded Definition of Byproduct Material Parts 20, 30, 31, 32, 33, 35, 61, 150 72 FR 55864	11/30/2010			
2007-4	Order Imposing Fingerprinting Requirements and Criminal History Records Check Requirements for Unescorted Access to Certain Radioactive Material NRC Order EA-07-305 72 FR 70901	06/05/2008	License Condition ML080980588	No Comments 05/01/2008 ML081220351	
2008-1	Occupational Dose Records, Labeling Containers, and Total Effective Dose Equivalent Parts 19, 20 72 FR 68043	02/15/2011			
2009-1	Medical Use of Byproduct Material – Authorized User Clarification Part 35 74 FR 33901	09/28/2012			
★ N/A	10 CFR 61.13 and 40.13	N/A	Proposed ML100110020	Comments 01/21/2010 ML100110047	